Refugee Review Tribunal
AUSTRALIA

RRT RESEARCH RESPONSE

Research Response Number: IDN34391
Country: Indonesia
Date: 19 February 2009

Keywords: Indonesia – Bali – Lombok – Christians – Christian political parties – Religious violence – Christian converts

This response was prepared by the Research & Information Services Section of the Refugee Review Tribunal (RRT) after researching publicly accessible information currently available to the RRT within time constraints. This response is not, and does not purport to be, conclusive as to the merit of any particular claim to refugee status or asylum. This research response may not, under any circumstance, be cited in a decision or any other document. Anyone wishing to use this information may only cite the primary source material contained herein.

Questions

1. Please provide information on the unrest in Lombok around the year 2000, and advise as to whether Christians were attacked before this time?
2. Please provide information on the Indonesian Churches Party?
3. Please provide any information regarding an attack on a Catholic Church in Denpasar in 1999.
4. Please provide an update on religious harmony in Bali, and advise whether religious groups, including Christians, are able to practice their religion freely?
5. Does the Balinese government in the main or exclusively employ Hindus?
6. Was there an increase in conversions to Christianity in Bali following the bombings in 2002 and 2005, and what is the attitude of the Hindu community to conversion?

RESPONSE

1. Please provide information on the unrest in Lombok around the year 2000, and advise as to whether Christians were attacked before this time?

According to the available information there were anti-Christian riots in Lombok in January 2000. The US Department of State religious freedom reports for 2000 and 2001 provide details of the re-emergence of ethnic and religious based communal conflict in the late 1990s as central leadership and control weakened and Soeharto stepped down (US Department of State 2000, *International Religious Freedom Report for 2000 – Indonesia*, September –

Attachment 1; US Department of State 2001, *International Religious Freedom Report for 2001 – Indonesia*, October – Attachment 2).

The US Department of State religious freedom report for 2000 states that "religious intolerance within society became markedly more visible and was manifested in scores of violent incidents in Maluku, Sulawesi, Lombok, and elsewhere":

> The Government's level of respect for religious freedom remained generally constant during the period covered by this report; however, religious intolerance within society became markedly more visible and was manifested in scores of violent incidents in Maluku, Sulawesi, **Lombok**, and elsewhere.
>
> There were numerous attacks on churches in various locations throughout the country, ranging from minor damage to total destruction; only a few cases, if any, were investigated thoroughly, and there were no reports that any perpetrators were punished. Mosques also were targeted for attack in some instances, especially during the ongoing interreligious strife in North Maluku and Maluku provinces (also known as the Molucca Islands), and around Poso, Central Sulawesi. Religious intolerance led to violence in several regions, particularly in the Moluccas and Central Sulawesi. It generally is estimated that approximately 4,000 persons have been killed in the Moluccus strife since violence erupted in January 1999. The victims were roughly equally divided between Christians and Muslims. In addition to intercommunal violence in Maluku and North Maluku provinces, significant religious conflict also occurred on the islands of Sulawesi and **Lombok**.
>
> …In January 2000, there were anti-Christian riots in Mataram, **Lombok**. Several rioters were killed and numerous persons were injured in the violence. In addition Muslim gangs destroyed, damaged, and looted Christian homes, businesses, and other property. Thousands of Christians fled the violence. However, by the end of January 2000 the situation became calmer, and as of June 30, 2000, reports of further violence were rare; nevertheless, tensions remained (US Department of State 2000, *International Religious Freedom Report for 2000 – Indonesia*, September – Attachment 1).

US Department of State religious freedom report for 2001 gives some background:

> The economic crisis that began in mid-1997 and continued through the period covered by this report, severely affected millions of citizens, pushing many below the poverty line and reversing the gains of the newly emerging middle class. With the weakening of central leadership and control – Soeharto stepped down in May 1998 – ethnically and religiously based communal conflict reemerged in the late 1990's. In 1997 ethnic/religious conflict broke out in West Kalimantan, and the tempo of violence increased after 1998, breaking out and continuing in pockets all over the archipelago (e.g., the Moluccas, Java, Kalimantan, Sumatra, **Lombok**, Irian Jaya/Papua, and Sulawesi); this violence continued during the period covered by this report. Most of the violence was attributable to unaddressed grievances and frustration with arbitrary central government development and migration policies that had, in many areas, upset delicate ethnic and religious balances. In the absence of a healthy civil society and democratic culture to arbitrate differences peacefully, this frustration was provoked easily and often took the form of extrajudicial violence under the banner of an ethnic/religious crusade. Despite the Government's general religious tolerance, it was unable to stop the sectarian violence or rein in religious extremism, particularly for the Muslim majority.
>
> …There were numerous attacks on churches and some attacks on mosques in various locations throughout the country, ranging from minor damage to total destruction; only a few cases, if any, were investigated thoroughly, and there were no reports of perpetrators being punished (see Section II). According to the Indonesian Christian Communication Forum,

> from January 1999 to April 2001, 327 churches were closed or destroyed, while the Ministry of Religion reports that 254 mosques were attacked or destroyed during the same period. Most of the attacks and destruction occurred in the Moluccas. From July 1, 2000 to May 31, 2001, there were 108 reported incidents of destruction of churches (compared to 163 incidents reported in the previous period) including 21 attacks on churches in Java; 20 in Sumatra, 10 in **Lombok**; 9 in South, Central, and Southeast Sulawesi; and 5 in North Sumatra (Medan) (US Department of State 2001, *International Religious Freedom Report for 2001 – Indonesia*, October – Attachment 2).

According to a 2003 International Crisis Group (ICG) report, the economic crisis of 1998-1999 "hurt Lombok badly" and:

> …exacerbated tensions between wealthy urban Christian Chinese merchant communities and the impoverished Sasak peasantry. As early as January 1998, Lombok's Chinese merchants closed their shops for fear of attacks by Central Lombok farmers who blamed them for the rise in the cost of rice and other basic commodities.
>
> In February 1998, anti-Chinese riots erupted in Praya, Central Lombok, as elsewhere in Indonesia at the time. The Praya riots were followed by smaller clashes in 1999 and a very violent anti-Christian, anti-Chinese riot in January 2000 in Mataram that destroyed twelve churches and led to the effective displacement of ethnic Chinese to Bali and East Java (International Crisis Group 2003, *The Perils of Private Security in Indonesia: Guards and Militias on Bali and Lombok*, Asia Report no.67, 7 November, p. 14 – Attachment 3).

A previous research response, dated 23 January 2001, provides a sourced chronology of riots in Lombok in 1999 and 2000 (RRT Country Research 2001, *Research Response IDN14480*, 23 January – Attachment 4).

For a description of the January 2000 Lombok violence, see the following media reports:

- Parry, R. 2000, 'Muslim mobs hunt Christians on resort island of Lombok', *The Independent*, 19 January http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/asia/muslim-mobs-hunt-christians-on-resort-island-of-lombok-727306.html – Accessed 17 February 2009 – Attachment 5;

- 'Indonesia Churches Destroyed By Muslim Mob In A Central Indonesia Island' 2000, Union of Catholic Asian News website, 19 January http://www.ucanews.com/2000/01/19/churches-destroyed-by-muslim-mob-in-a-central-indonesia-island/ – Accessed 17 February 2009 – Attachment 6.

2. Please provide information on the Indonesian Churches Party?

No information on an "Indonesian Churches Party" was found in the available sources. Information was found indicating that there are a number of Christian political parties in Indonesia. According to the 1999 US Department of State report, "For the first time since the beginning of the Soeharto regime, religiously oriented parties, predominantly Islamic but including some Christian, were allowed to form and to contest the 1999 parliamentary elections" (US Department of State 1999, *International Religious Freedom Report for 1999 – Indonesia*, September – Attachment 7).

The following sources provide some information on Christian and Catholic political parties and political activity.

A 2006 article on the Indonesia Matters website discusses the merger of seven Protestant and Catholic political parties, stating that "of the 237 political parties registered with the government 14 are Christian based. There are also five others that were formed in 2005 and 2006 but which are not registered yet". The article states:

> Seven Protestant and Catholic political parties will merge.
>
> The seven parties are Partai Kristen Indonesia 1945 (Parkindo 1945), Partai Katolik Demokrasi Indonesia, (PKD Indonesia), Partai Pewarta Damai Kasih Bangsa (PPDKB), Partai Anugerah Demokrat (PAD), Partai Demokrasi Kasih Bangsa Indonesia (PDKBI), Partai Amanat Kasih dan Partai Demokrat Kristen, Gatra reports.
>
> Importantly the main Christian party, the Partai Damai Sejahtera (PDS), is not included in the merger. Of the 237 political parties registered with the government 14 are Christian based. There are also five others that were formed in 2005 and 2006 but which are not registered yet.
>
> Sources in the coalition of seven Christian parties said that the PDS had been invited to join but had not signaled any intention to take part in talks. The secretary of the Parkindo 1945, Max Nikijuluw, said that he hoped more Christian parties would join the coalition later.
>
> In order to gain full party status in the parliament any party must gather at least 3.5% of the vote in the 2009 elections and given that the new coalition may be competing with the PDS it is likely that the Christian vote in the country will simply be split and neither will reach the threshold of 3.5% ('Christian Parties Merge' 2006, Indonesia Matters website, 1 June http://www.indonesiamatters.com/407/christian-parties-merge/ – Accessed 17 February 2009 – Attachment 8).

According to the US Department of State religious freedom report for 2003, "[t]he country has five Christian parties: the Indonesian Christian Party (Partindo); the National Indonesian Christian Party (KRISNA); the Catholic Democratic Party (PKD); the Catholic Party (PK); and the Democratic People's Devotion Party (PDKB)" (US Department of State 2003, *International Religious Freedom Report for 2003 – Indonesia*, December – Attachment 9).

According to the US Department of State religious freedom report for 2002, "[t]he country has three Christian parties: the National Indonesian Christian Party (KRISNA); the Catholic Democratic Party (PKD); and the Democratic People's Devotion Party (PDKB)" (US Department of State 2002, *International Religious Freedom Report for 2002 – Indonesia*, October – Attachment 10).

Question 4 of *Research Response IDN20663*, dated 15 December 1995, gives brief information on the history of Catholic and Protestant political parties in Indonesia (RRT Country Research 1995, *Research Response IDN20663*, 15 December – Attachment 11),

A 2003 UCAN article reports on Catholic involvement in politics in Indonesia. More recently, a 2008 UCAN article discusses Christian political parties ('Catholics expected to make mark in 2004 elections' 2003, Union of Catholic Asian News website, 7 March http://www.ucanews.com/2003/03/07/catholics-expected-to-make-mark-in-2004-elections/ – Accessed 17 February 2009 – Attachment 12; 'Christian Political Parties Questioned' 2008, Union of Catholic Asian News website, 4 April http://www.ucanews.com/2008/04/04/christian-political-parties-questioned/ – Accessed 17 February 2009 – Attachment 13).

3. Please provide any information regarding an attack on a Catholic Church in Denpasar in 1999.

A search of the available sources did not find any mention of an attack on a Catholic Church in Denpasar in 1999.

According to the 2003 ICG report, there was election violence in October 1999 in Denpasar and other areas in Bali. A *Jakarta Post* article reports that, among other buildings in Denpasar, the Maranatha Church was vandalised during the unrest. According to an Indo.com article, Maranatha is a Protestant Church (International Crisis Group 2003, *The Perils of Private Security in Indonesia: Guards and Militias on Bali and Lombok*, Asia Report no.67, 7 November, p. 6 – Attachment 3; 'Megawati's victory calms unrest' 1999, *Jakarta Post*, 22 October – Attachment 14; 'High tolerance in end of the year seen around Surapati street' (undated), Indo.com website http://www.indo.com/featured_article/tolerance.html – Accessed 17 February 2009 – Attachment 15).

Previous research responses have looked at whether there were attacks on Christians in Bali around 1999. No mention of an attack on a Catholic Church in Denpasar was found. The following research responses look at Christians in Bali around 1999 (attachments can be provided on request):

- Question 2 of *Research Response IDN14472*, dated 16 January 2001, found no reports which provided details of specific incidents of violence on the island of Bali around December 2000 to January 2001 (RRT Country Research 2001, *Research Response IDN14472*, 16 January – Attachment 16);

- *Research Response IDN14450*, dated 20 December 2000, found no evidence of attacks on Christians in Bali (RRT Country Research 2000, *Research Response IDN14450*, 20 December – Attachment 17);

- *Research Response IDN13427*, dated 25 February 1999, provides a chronology of account of incidents of clashes, unrest, conflict, protest or violence which was reported to have taken place in Bali between February 1998 and February 1999. The response found no direct references to Christians being directly affected by incidents of inter-religious and/or inter-ethnic violence in Bali from February 1998 to February 1999 (RRT Country Research 1999, *Research Response IDN13427*, 25 February – Attachment 18).

4. Please provide an update on religious harmony in Bali, and advise whether religious groups, including Christians, are able to practice their religion freely?

Previous research responses have looked at the topic of religious harmony and freedom of worship in Bali. Question 3 of *Research Response IDN33539*, dated 8 July 2008, provides general information on the situation for Bali's Catholic population and Bali's other Christian communities. *Research Response IDN31305*, dated 7 February 2007, provides information on freedom of worship in Bali and some general information on Christians in Bali (RRT Research & Information 2008, *Research Response IDN33539*, 8 July – Attachment 19; RRT Country Research 2007, *Research Response IDN31305*, 7 February – Attachment 20). A search of the available sources did not turn up any information suggesting that the situation

has changed. No new reports of mistreatment of Christians in Bali were found in the available information.

A December 2008 article in *The Jakarta Post* describes the religious harmony in Bali (Wisnu, A. 2008, 'In Puja Mandala, religion lays no barrier', *Jakarta Post*, 27 December http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2008/12/27/in-puja-mandala-religion-lays-no-barrier.html – Accessed 17 February 2009 – Attachment 21).

An October 2008 Union of Catholic News article describes a newly blessed Marian shrine in Bali which attracts both Catholics and Hindus:

> A newly blessed Marian shrine on Bali Island has made a difference to the lives of not only Catholics but also local Hindus who go and pray there.
>
> Every day Catholics both from within and outside the predominantly Hindu island-province visit the shrine in Palasari. Bali's only predominantly Catholic village is in Melaya district, about 90 kilometers northwest of Denpasar, the provincial capital.
>
> Pilgrims have been coming to the shrine, which has a Marian grotto and the Stations of the Cross, since early this year, even before it was blessed in September, Father Laurensius Maryono said.
>
> But in addition to Catholics, the shrine also attracts a number of Hindus living around the area, the parish priest continued. "On certain nights, they come here to pray according to their own faith. They bring flowers and place them at the foot of the Marian grotto."
>
> The shrine, *Palinggih Ida Kaniyaka Maria* (holy place of Mary), is built next to Sacred Heart of Jesus Church. Construction began in 2005, and Archbishop Leopoldo Girelli, apostolic nuncio to Indonesia, blessed the shrine this Sept. 15, when the parish also celebrated the 50th anniversary of its church and its own 68th anniversary.
>
> Speaking to about 1,000 people at that event, Archbishop Girelli noted Bali is an international tourist destination. He said he hopes the shrine "will be a blessing not only for people in Palasari but also for everyone who comes here."
>
> UCA News interviewed several local people who say they have already benefited from visiting and praying at the shrine.
>
> Damianus Duran said he had visited the shrine four times with his family, and they have experienced peace in return. "Almost every problem in my family can be solved," the 52-year-old father of three said. "I realize it is not because of my capability, but the protection of the Blessed Mother."
>
> On one of his visits, the Catholic man brought his Hindu neighbor – a civil servant who said she had a desire to visit the shrine but lacked the courage – together with her family.
>
> The woman, Jro Pudak, 43, said that earlier, while praying at home, she had had a vision of a woman who identified herself as Mother Mary. "She came suddenly and whispered to me. She wanted me to bring flowers and fruit as offerings to the new shrine," Pudak recalled.
>
> Flowers and fruit are Balinese Hindus' usual offerings at religious ceremonies.

Pudak said she prayed and meditated for two hours at the shrine without asking for anything, because she only wanted to thank Mother Mary for greeting that first night.

"I believe Mother Mary is interceding for us with God," she continued, adding that she felt something had changed within her after the shrine visit. "I easily got angry and jealous. But now I am more patient and not so easily jealous. I believe Mother Mary has cleansed me," she said.

Another local Hindu, Ni Made Suartini, has been visiting the shrine twice a week for three months. "I bring my only intention – healing for my eyes," said the 45-year-old woman who lost her eyesight a year ago.

"A beautiful woman who identified herself as Mother Mary came into my dream three months ago and asked me to go to the new shrine," Suartini said. The following morning, she went to the shrine together with a Catholic relative for the first time.

Ever since, each time she has prayed at the shrine, she has washed her eyes with the holy water at the site. "Every time something like sand comes out, and I feel better," Suartini said. During the three months, she has gained back some of her eyesight, although her vision is still blurred.

Palinggih Ida Kaniyaka Maria is the second Marian shrine in Bali. The first, the Marian Grotto of Sanih Water, about 60 kilometers north of Denpasar, was blessed and inaugurated by the late Bishop Benyamin Yosef Bria of Denpasar in 2005.

Palasari, as the first Catholic settlement on Bali, has long attracted Catholics visiting the island ('New Bali Marian Shrine Attracts Catholics And Hindus' 2008, Union of Catholic Asian News website, 14 October http://www.ucanews.com/2008/10/14/new-bali-marian-shrine-attracts-catholics-and-hindus/ – Accessed 17 February 2009 – Attachment 22).

5. Does the Balinese government in the main or exclusively employ Hindus?

No information was found on whether the Bali government employs mainly or only Hindus. One article found on the Indahnesia.com website states that Javanese and Madurese migrants "fill the ranks of the civil service" in Denpasar. A 2003 ICG report gives information on village level government (*banjar*) in Bali and the "blurring of the former distinction between official and traditional functions in the way village structures operated". The report states that the "rights of non-Hindu residents living under traditional structures remain a neglected feature of Balinese village administration reform" ('City of villages and even more crowded than Jakarta' (undated), Indahnesia.com website http://indahnesia.com/indonesia/BALDEN/denpasar_information.php – Accessed 17 February 2009 – Attachment 23; International Crisis Group 2003, *The Perils of Private Security in Indonesia: Guards and Militias on Bali and Lombok*, Asia Report no.67, 7 November, pp. 6-7 – Attachment 3).

A 2003 ICG report does describe the use of traditional Balinese Hindu ritual guards called *pecalang* as civilian auxiliaries in Bali. The report also discusses village level government (*banjar*) in Bali. The report states:

Together with decentralisation and the perceived inadequacy of the police, the anti-migrant sentiment helped spur the rise of the *pecalang*.

Civilian auxiliaries were not a novel idea. During the New Order, Balinese had relied on civil guards, recruited and trained by sub-district military commands, and on municipal guards called *tibum*, in addition to the military and police. The *tibum* were active in Denpasar and district capitals where they were tasked with enforcing directives issued by local administrative officials. Their duties consisted of smashing vendors' carts and market stalls deemed in violation of local codes. Each year the guards worked hard to clear unlicensed market areas that might endanger their district's chances of winning awards such as the much coveted *adipura* cleanliness prize. Provincial regulations regarding prostitution, karaoke bars, and "entertainment zones" were also subject to inspection by *tibum* guards.

These forces were replaced in early 2001 by the Peace and Order Guard (Ketentraman dan Ketertiban or *tramtib*). *Tramtib* were civil servants with military-like uniforms. After January 2001, under the new decentralisation laws, districts had the authority to write their own ordinances governing the use of *tramtib* for enforcement of municipal codes and to hire people accordingly. Monitoring prostitution, gambling activities, unlicensed housing, market-stall placement and non-local migrants without updated residence permits or identity cards were all part of the *tramtib's* responsibilities.

But often it was unclear where *tramtib* authority left off and *pecalang* jurisdiction began. In one incident in early 2003, *pecalang* from the village of Kesiman in eastern Denpasar actually arrested *tramtib* guards who were collecting protection fees from local prostitutes.

Changes in village structure also affected security. Provincial Regulation No. 3/2001 in Bali created what was called *desa pakraman*, which involved a blurring of the former distinction between official and traditional functions in the way village structures operated. *Banjar* residents and officials were henceforth both involved in the monitoring, taxation and security of village residents, whether local or non-local, Balinese or non-Balinese.

The positive side was that Bali's populace acquired a new sense of entitlement and responsibility for their own communities; the negative side was that untrained villagers were involved in tasks normally reserved for government tax officials, police, municipal guards or military officers. A decade of growing anti-outsider sentiment also provided Balinese with the means and legal instruments to intimidate, punish and tax non-Balinese Indonesian citizens living in their communities.

The legal jurisdiction of *desa pakraman* remains unclear two years later. Regulation N°3 acknowledged the legal authority of the village- or hamlet-level ordinances drafted through debates and consensus over long periods of time. However, *pararem* – neighbourhood regulations – can be passed at the sub-*banjar* or *tempekan* level, often with only the signature of the local hamlet head, and are not subject to monitoring by higher-level officials.

Several communities, for example, reportedly are considering regulations imposing cockfighting taxes on all members of the community, whether or not they gamble. Some regulations are tantamount to official extortion of migrants. As long as no one files a complaint, the ordinances go unchallenged.

A possible remedy to this problem may lie with the planned but not yet functioning province-wide network of *pakraman* councils. These have been mandated to hear, challenge or process complaints as they arise at the sub-district, district and provincial levels. At no level in this structure, however, does an advisory body exist which can hear complaints voiced by non-Balinese. The rights of non-Hindu residents living under traditional structures remain a

> neglected feature of Balinese village administration reform (International Crisis Group 2003, *The Perils of Private Security in Indonesia: Guards and Militias on Bali and Lombok*, Asia Report no.67, 7 November, pp. 6-7 – Attachment 3).

An article on Denpasar found on the Indahnesia.com website states that:

> Most migrants…are Javanese and Madurese, known collectively as "jawa." They fill the ranks of the civil service and the military (Sanglah and Kayumas areas) as well as the working classes, skilled and unskilled (Pekambingan, Kayumas, "Kampung Jawa" areas) ('City of villages and even more crowded than Jakarta' (undated), Indahnesia.com website http://indahnesia.com/indonesia/BALDEN/denpasar_information.php – Accessed 17 February 2009 – Attachment 23).

6. Was there an increase in conversions to Christianity in Bali following the bombings in 2002 and 2005, and what is the attitude of the Hindu community to conversion?

No information was found on whether or not there was an increase in conversions to Christianity as a result of the Bali bombings. An article on the Yale Global Online website does state that "[a]fter the Bali bombing, the region experienced a rise in Hindu rituals and evangelical Christian appeals". Information was found from before the Bali bombings reporting that conversions to Christianity were increasing in Bali, according to the chairman of Bali's Hindu association quoted in a 2002 *Australian Associated Press* (AAP) article. According to the available information Christian converts face a certain level of resentment in Bali. A Bali overview page published on the Full Gospel Assembly website states that: "Balinese Christians generally face social ostracism by both their families and the community". Sources concur that religion and society are almost inextricably interwoven in Bali. The 2002 *AAP* article on the recent harassment of Christian converts in a Bali village seems to indicate that the resentment was related to the families no longer adhering to their community duties, rather than simply having changed faiths. The article states that "[c]onversions on Bali appear to be acceptable if they do not erode the ancient customs of communities" (Ghoshal, B. 2007, 'The Rise in Extremism – Part II', Yale Global Online website, 3 April http://yaleglobal.yale.edu/display.article?id=8997 – Accessed 17 February 2009 – Attachment 24; 'The Balinese of Indonesia' (undated), Full Gospel Assembly website http://www.fga.com.my/missions/PDF%20UPG/indonesia/balinese2.pdf – Accessed 8 July 2008 – Attachment 25; Munro, C. 2002, 'Religious tension flares on island of the gods', *Australian Associated Press*, 5 March – Attachment 26).

Attitudes to conversion

Research Response IDN33539 includes information on Balinese Hindu attitude to conversion (RRT Research & Information 2008, *Research Response IDN33539*, 8 July – Attachment 19). The response includes a briefing by Bishop Ketut Wispada, of Bali's Protestant Christian Church, on the situation of Balinese Christians to a seminar on Indonesia held by the Plowshares Institute (a US based social justice focused NGO of the United Methodist Church). According to this source local Balinese Christians (as opposed to foreign Christians) face a certain level of resentment, generally "live outside the island", and have been historically affected by local Hindu caste practices. Bishop Wispada states that "In Bali, religion is identity and origin, not so much faith or belief". The relevant sections follow:

> The Balinese don't understand if another Balinese is a Christian. To them, Hinduism is a part of being Balinese. For Balinese who convert – to others it's as if you are neglecting your duty

toward your ancestors. Hinduism does not have a mission like Christianity or Islam. You're born into it – if you convert, it seems like hypocrisy. The Balinese Christians are hated. So we have to understand why Balinese society does not like Christians. It's OK if you're a foreigner. Just not for a Balinese.

…The Balinese think that if you change religions you don't like them anymore. In Bali, religion is identity and origin, not so much faith or belief. 75% of Balinese Christians live outside the island. Many, when they converted, had to move to another island or to my village of Blimbing Sari, which is the only Christian village in Bali (2.5 hours one way by car from Denpasar). It was started in the 1930's when the Christians were sent to the far west of the island as refugees by the government.

There are four castes in Balinese Hindu society. The first Christian baptisms came from the second caste, Ksatria, and the pastor asked them to change their identity to the lowest caste. Here are the four:

1. Brahmana (priests)
2. Ksatria (warriors and government)
3. Waesia (everyone else)
4. Sudra, or Jaba ("outside the walls")

Jaba means "outsider". When Christians convert they all become Jaba. In the case of baptism, sometimes we have difficulties. I remember an old lady who converted from the highest caste. But since I came from the lowest caste, she did not want to be baptized by me.

For children, a caste is just a name. You can tell a caste by a name. Names preceded by I.B., or just I., come from Brahmana. Names followed by G.S.T. (Gusti, or Lord) come from Ksatria, and names followed by S.I. ("someone at the front") are from Waesia.

Society will honor those from the top caste, so language can be very difficult, as names for things also change according to caste. In other words, if you are addressing someone from the Brahmana caste, you must use all Brahmana vocabulary. For example: the Brahman word for "house" is gria, the Ksatria word for house" is puri, the Waesia is uma, and the Sudra word is kubu. When you meet, you have to say, "where do you sit?" in order to know how to talk to someone. Kids don't understand this. Before you talk you must ask. If you don't know, assume the highest caste. The solution to this is to use Bahasa Indonesia. In daily life among friends, Sudra is used. Even among the bus drivers, some are Brahman, so they all use the proper language of address. This is both for speech and protocol. It reinforces inherited privilege. Some people retain their names when they become Christians because the administrative aspect is so difficult. Otherwise they commonly did change their names. Jabas have no prefix or suffix (Wispada, K. 2005, 'Briefing on the Balinese', *Indonesia Seminar*, Plowshares Institute website, August http://www.plowsharesinstitute.com/Indonesia%20Report.pdf – Accessed 8 July 2008 – Attachment 27).

A March 2002 *Australian Associated Press* article, before the first Bali bombing, reports on an attack on Christian converts in a Bali village. The article states "five families of about 30 people were sorely punished when they dropped their Hindu duties, which are inextricably linked to the town's customs". The chairman of Bali's Hindu association is also quoted, saying that conversions were increasing on Bali. The article states:

The resort island of Bali is promoted in tourist literature as the island of the gods, but a group of Christians has found that depends on which one you worship.

For a group of Balinese who abandoned the ancient practices of Hinduism to become Christian, the response was swift and violent.

Bali is one of the few places in the country's vast archipelago where the Australian Embassy does not advise tourists to look out for problems.

The island has stayed safe amid the violence that has beset idyllic spots throughout the archipelago since the economic crisis in 1997 and the fall of former dictator Suharto in May 1998.

With Hindus making up 93 per cent of the island's three million-strong population, the religion has a much better reputation for tolerance amongst foreign tourists than Christianity and Islam.

But away from the smiling faces of tourist operators, Balinese Hindus who make up 93 per cent of the three-million-strong population are jealously protecting their culture.

In the lush hills of eastern Bali in the village of Katung, five families of about 30 people were sorely punished when they dropped their Hindu duties, which are inextricably linked to the town's customs.

Days after they started laying the foundations for a church last month, they became the victims of a late night fire attack in which their houses and cars were torched and destroyed.

Wayan Geban Sukadana, 24, said his parents were asleep in the family home when the attack came at 11pm. His 55-year-old father was knocked unconscious.

The empty house was torched when the family rushed him to hospital.

The incident was not the first such attack – Wayan remembers fleeing his home as a little boy in 1984 just after his family switched faiths.

"Then our house was stoned by not burned," he recalled.

"But I am not scared because God will show me the true path."

District police chief Heru Teguh Prayitno said two locals had been arrested and 64 questioned over the incident.

With Bali's image of being a haven of peace a major factor in its popularity with foreign tourists, local police were ordered to explain to their superiors in Jakarta what was going on.

Changing faiths was not the catalyst for the attacks, according to Ketut Suda Sugira, the senior authority on customs for Katung.

Instead, he said it was the fact that they no longer adhered to their community duties, such as cleaning the temple and the community meeting hall.

"Because they converted to Christianity they refused to participate," said Ketut, adding that they had also refused to pay a small monthly fee in lieu of performing their duties.

> Conversions on Bali appear to be acceptable if they do not erode the ancient customs of communities.
>
> Most of the island's 45,000 Christians have lived peacefully for decades near the town of Negara, on the western side of the island.
>
> The head of Bali's Protestant church, Suyaga Ayub, said a deal would have to be struck with the Hindu community in Katung because Christians should not have to follow Hindu practices.
>
> "It's not right. How is it possible that you are still doing religious ceremonies of another religion?"
>
> Made Titip, the chairman of Bali's Hindu association, said conversions were increasing on Bali.
>
> "My casual observation is that Christianity and Islam are competing in spreading their religion here in Bali," he said.
>
> "Two years ago, the percentage of Hindu followers was about 95 per cent but now it is about 93 per cent" (Munro, C. 2002, 'Religious tension flares on island of the gods', *Australian Associated Press*, 5 March – Attachment 26).

An article on early missionary activity in Bali from the anti-conversion website, Christian Aggression.com[1], although biased, does highlight the links between community obligations and religion. It states that "everything from the banjar, to the ceremonies, to the control of water, to life and death is structured around their religious beliefs":

> But towards the end of 1930 the American missionaries again succeeded in securing an [entrance], supposedly only to care for souls already saved and not seek new converts. But quietly and ostentatiously they began to work among the lowest classes of the Balinese. The more sincere of the early missionaries had aimed at obtaining converts of conviction and consequently had failed, but these later missionaries wanted quicker results and followed more effective methods. Taking advantage of the economic crisis that was already making itself felt in Bali, they managed to give their practically destitute candidates for Christianity the idea that a change of faith would release then from all financial obligations to the community – all they had to do was pronounce the formula: Saja pertjaja Jesoes Kristos – I believe in Jesus Christ. If the man who was induced to pronounce the magic words was the head of the household, the missionaries claimed every member of the family as Christians and soon they could boast about 300 converts.
>
> Soon enough the new Christian discovered they had been misled; they had to pay taxes just the same, had become undesirable to their communities, and were being boycotted. In Mengwi, where the missionaries had their greatest success, the authorities refused to release converts from their duties, bringing endless conflict with the village and water distribution boards. In many villages regulations were written into local laws to the effect that those who were unfaithful to the Balinese religion were to be declared dead; meetings were held to discuss the possibility of banishing the converts to remote parts like Jembrana, together with other criminals. The Christians had also become deeply concerned when they found out they could not dispose of their dead, because they were not permitted to bury them in the village

[1] In the 'About Us' page, the website states that it "seeks to educate the world about the atrocities that conversions bring and to bring this aggressive nature of Christianity to an end" (http://www.christianaggression.org/about_need.php).

> cemeteries and all the other available lands were either rice fields or wild places. At times the situation became intense and near riot took place. The alarmed village heads reasoned with some converts and succeeded in bringing back a number of them to the old faith.
>
> Covarrubias gives further examples of Balinese converting to Christianity not really understanding the meaning and converting back to Agama Hindu. He then goes on:
>
> In the meantime, while the controversy rages on, the shrewd missionaries are steadily gaining ground. At present a Catholic priest and a Protestant missionary are stationed in Denpasar, and another missionary, a Catholic, is stationed in Buleleng, all three undoubtedly discreet but tireless in their efforts to save the Balinese.
>
> But Bali is certainly not the place where missionaries could improve in any way the moral and physical standards of the people and it is hard to believe, knowing the Balinese character, that they will succeed. Religion is to the Balinese more than spectacular ceremonies with music, dancing, and a touch of drama for virility; it is their law, the force that holds the community together. It is the greatest stimulus of their lives because it has given them their ethics, culture, wisdom, and joy of living by providing the exuberant festivity they love. More than a religion, it is a moral philosophy of high spiritual value, gay and free of fanaticism, which explains to them the mysterious forces of nature. It is difficult to imagine that it will ever be supplanted by a bleak escapist faith devoid of beautiful and dramatic ritual.
>
> This was written in 1937 and to this day most Balinese are Agama Hindu. Obviously Covarrubias is totally against missionaries and in love with the Balinese culture, but what he says about the religion being the center piece of Balinese life is totally true, everything from the banjar, to the ceremonies, to the control of water, to life and death is structured around their religious beliefs. Take away that central system and much of the social fabric is gone ('Missionaries in Bali: Why they failed' 2005, Christian Aggression website, 6 April http://www.christianaggression.org/item_display.php?id=1144303222&type=articles – Accessed 17 February 2009 – Attachment 28).

Cost of rituals

According to the 2003 ICG report, a lot of money was spent on religious and traditional rituals and festivals in Bali, which entailed "a heavy tax burden for Balinese during the late New Order" [1990s]:

> Village officials continued to spend considerable time and money on religious and traditional affairs. Traditional functionaries maintained village temples, held rituals and coordinated with police and villages on holy days when rival villages used the same roads and facilities. Traditional officials at the village level would communicate information to *banjar* leaders regarding village, district, or province-wide rituals and festivals requiring their cooperation. These rituals entailed a heavy tax burden for Balinese during the late New Order when Bali's religious organisation, Parisadha Hindu Dharma, collected funds to hold massive province-wide rituals at Besakih, Bali's mother temple (International Crisis Group 2003, *The Perils of Private Security in Indonesia: Guards and Militias on Bali and Lombok*, Asia Report no.67, 7 November, p. 3 – Attachment 3).

An undated article on the Bali Blog website notes the writer's neighbour, a Balinese Christian, who "likes not having to pay for offerings or ceremonies" and proudly showed off his new car:

> Nyepi, the Balinese Day of Silence is over. People are back to their daily activities and Bali is silent no more. During Nyepi people of all faiths were required to stay at home, without lights of making any noise. One Catholic seminary in a Balinese village closed for 3 days out of

respect for Nyepi.

The village of Tuka is located 13kms west of Denpasar and contains 145 Catholic families and 9 Hindu families, with many Catholic families coming from surrounding villages. Bishop Benyamin Yosef Bria of Denpasar said "Because Nyepi and Lenten time coincided, we can use the time to reflect on the suffering of Christ who sacrificed himself to give salvation to his people."

One of my neighbors, Mr Wayan is a Balinese Christian, which must be a strange position to be in during times of religious celebration. He told me he likes not having to pay for offerings or ceremonies and proudly showed me his new car. West Bali has 2 villages that are predominately Christian. Belimbingsari is Protestant and Palasari is Catholic ('Catholic church in Bali closes for Nyepi' (undated), Bali Blog website http://www.baliblog.com/travel-tips/bali-travel/catholic-church-in-bali-closes-for-nyepi.html – Accessed 17 February 2009 – Attachment 29).

Other

An article titled 'Trouble In Bali Paradise', written after the 2002 Bali bombing, gives an analysis of religious and societal situation of the island:

Bali has managed to maintain this sense of identity as well as territorial integrity throughout history. Muslims have never succeeded in invading Bali, though Bali has attacked and occupied both eastern Java and Lombok. In the 14th century, Javanese mercenaries to a Balinese king were given land in Gelgel, near Klungkung. This village still exists and is home to Bali's oldest Muslim community. Traditional Javanese Islam, a blend of Sufism mixed with animist and Hindu concepts predating Islam, shares common heritage with Bali. The two largest Muslim organizations in Indonesia, Muhammadiah and Nadhatul Ulama, preach tolerance towards Balinese Hinduism by referring to the surah al-Kafirun verse of al-Quran, "Your religion is your religion; my religion is my religion."

Social and economic ties between the communities are also strong. Visit the traditional market in Badung and you will see sheaths of coconut leaves that are woven into a wide variety of offerings used by Balinese in religious ceremonies. These coconut leaves are imported and sold in Bali by Javanese Muslims. Balinese and Muslims frequently marry, and in some villages the local brand of Islam is so mixed with Hinduism that the Muslim farmers make offerings to Dewi Sri, the Goddess of rice. Hindu boys attend their Muslim friend's circumcision ceremonies, and Muslims in some areas adopt Balinese Hindu first names. It is not uncommon to meet a Muslim with a name like Ketut Ahmad Ibrahim.

In recent years, however, orthodox or revivalist Islam has been on the rise throughout Indonesia, which seems to be polarizing the Hindu and Muslim communities. Hadrami communities in Indonesia, people of Yemen decent who claim as birthright an orthodox knowledge of Islam, along with the Internet and current political and social influences, push Muslims in Bali to construct a self identity as a Mukmin among Kafir (believer among unbelievers), which is perceived by Balinese as social discrimination. "This has led to a growth in Bali of a parallel religious revivalism among Hindu-Balinese who increasingly see themselves as 'Hindus' globally opposed to 'Muslims,'" says Nazrina Zuryani, a Muslim scholar living in Bali.

Balinese Hinduism is very different from Hinduism as practiced in India. Balinese Hinduism is Saivite and Buddhist tantric based. The caste system is not strong, but rather a clan-based system takes preeminence. Balinese believe in reincarnation, especially that they will be reincarnated back into their own families. While these aspects of Balinese Hinduism remain

strong, there is a strong interest in the Hinduism of India, with India substituting for Mecca as the holy land.

…One of the most disturbing developments since 12 October is the growth of Balinese militia groups called *pecalang*. Pecalang were originally conceived of as a kind of traditional police force to serve as security for religious events. They became further militarized by the political parties who then began to use them to protect political events. Now, nearly every village has a group of *pecalang*, mostly out-of-work youths, who have recently begun "sweeps" in search of residents without proper KIPP credentials. As was the case in 1965, *pecalang* often enter agreements with neighboring villages' *pecalang* groups to mutually "sweep" each other, a system meant to promote impartiality, but a system that also prevents a militia member from showing sympathy to one's own neighbors.

It should also be pointed out that extra-communal violence, mob killings of petty thieves, for example, are fairly common in Bali and all over Indonesia. No precise figures are kept, and such events are rarely reported even in local papers, but nearly everyone who has spent any time in Bali has a story to tell.

Just recently, an expatriate living in a village not far from the center of Bali's capital witnessed a group of *pecalang* capture and kill two Muslim boys from Lombok. The boys had been accused by a villager of theft, though no stolen goods were found on their persons. The boys were approximately 12 and 14 years old. Police appeared after the fact to bring the bodies to the morgue. None of the *pecalang* was arrested. The expatriate's son—also a boy of 14, witnessed the murders, and apparently has been seriously traumatized by the event.

While the potential for violence in Bali is quite real, there are many other factors that may help prevent large scale violence from erupting. Indonesia's Military Command center for the East Nusa Tengara region is in Bali, and the military, which owns a number of tourist hotels, has a vested interest in keeping a lid on violence. Both Muslims and Hindus have too much to lose if Bali's tourist industry is further hit. While Balinese Hindus are a majority on Bali, they still represent only two percent of Indonesia's population, a figure that does not favor confrontation (McGuire, D. 2003, 'Trouble In Bali Paradise', Hinduism Today website, July/August/September http://www.hinduismtoday.com/archives/2003/7-9/28-31_bali.shtml – Accessed 7 July 2008 – Attachment 30).

List of Sources Consulted

Internet Sources:

Google search engine http://www.google.com

Databases:

FACTIVA (news database)
BACIS (DIAC Country Information database)
REFINFO (IRBDC (Canada) Country Information database)
ISYS (RRT Research & Information database, including Amnesty International, Human Rights Watch, US Department of State Reports)
RRT Library Catalogue

List of Attachments

1. US Department of State 2000, *International Religious Freedom Report for 2000 – Indonesia*, September.

2. US Department of State 2001, *International Religious Freedom Report for 2001 – Indonesia*, October.

3. International Crisis Group 2003, *The Perils of Private Security in Indonesia: Guards and Militias on Bali and Lombok*, Asia Report no.67, 7 November.

4. RRT Country Research 2001, *Research Response IDN14480*, 23 January.

5. Parry, R. 2000, 'Muslim mobs hunt Christians on resort island of Lombok', *The Independent*, 19 January http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/asia/muslim-mobs-hunt-christians-on-resort-island-of-lombok-727306.html – Accessed 17 February 2009.

6. 'Indonesia Churches Destroyed By Muslim Mob In A Central Indonesia Island' 2000, Union of Catholic Asian News website, 19 January http://www.ucanews.com/2000/01/19/churches-destroyed-by-muslim-mob-in-a-central-indonesia-island/ – Accessed 17 February 2009.

7. US Department of State 1999, *International Religious Freedom Report for 1999 – Indonesia*, September.

8. 'Christian Parties Merge' 2006, Indonesia Matters website, 1 June http://www.indonesiamatters.com/407/christian-parties-merge/ – Accessed 17 February 2009.

9. US Department of State 2003, *International Religious Freedom Report for 2003 – Indonesia*, December.

10. US Department of State 2002, *International Religious Freedom Report for 2002 – Indonesia*, October.

11. RRT Country Research 1995, *Research Response IDN20663*, 15 December.

12. 'Catholics expected to make mark in 2004 elections' 2003, Union of Catholic Asian News website, 7 March http://www.ucanews.com/2003/03/07/catholics-expected-to-make-mark-in-2004-elections/ – Accessed 17 February 2009.

13. 'Christian Political Parties Questioned' 2008, Union of Catholic Asian News website, 4 April http://www.ucanews.com/2008/04/04/christian-political-parties-questioned/ – Accessed 17 February 2009.

14. 'Megawati's victory calms unrest' 1999, *Jakarta Post*, 22 October. (FACTIVA)

15. 'High tolerance in end of the year seen around Surapati street' (undated), Indo.com website http://www.indo.com/featured_article/tolerance.html – Accessed 17 February 2009.

16. RRT Country Research 2001, *Research Response IDN14472*, 16 January.

17. RRT Country Research 2000, *Research Response IDN14450*, 20 December.

18. RRT Country Research 1999, *Research Response IDN13427*, 25 February.

19. RRT Research & Information 2008, *Research Response IDN33539*, 8 July.

20. RRT Country Research 2007, *Research Response IDN31305*, 7 February.

21. Wisnu, A. 2008, 'In Puja Mandala, religion lays no barrier', *Jakarta Post*, 27 December http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2008/12/27/in-puja-mandala-religion-lays-no-barrier.html – Accessed 17 February 2009.

22. 'New Bali Marian Shrine Attracts Catholics And Hindus' 2008, Union of Catholic Asian News website, 14 October http://www.ucanews.com/2008/10/14/new-bali-marian-shrine-attracts-catholics-and-hindus/ – Accessed 17 February 2009.

23. 'City of villages and even more crowded than Jakarta' (undated), Indahnesia.com website http://indahnesia.com/indonesia/BALDEN/denpasar_information.php – Accessed 17 February 2009.

24. Ghoshal, B. 2007, 'The Rise in Extremism – Part II', Yale Global Online website, 3 April http://yaleglobal.yale.edu/display.article?id=8997 – Accessed 17 February 2009.

25. 'The Balinese of Indonesia' (undated), Full Gospel Assembly website http://www.fga.com.my/missions/PDF%20UPG/indonesia/balinese2.pdf – Accessed 8 July 2008.

26. Munro, C. 2002, 'Religious tension flares on island of the gods', *Australian Associated Press*, 5 March. (FACTIVA)

27. Wispada, K. 2005, 'Briefing on the Balinese', *Indonesia Seminar*, Plowshares Institute website, August http://www.plowsharesinstitute.com/Indonesia%20Report.pdf – Accessed 8 July 2008.

28. 'Missionaries in Bali: Why they failed' 2005, Christian Aggression website, 6 April http://www.christianaggression.org/item_display.php?id=1144303222&type=articles – Accessed 17 February 2009.

29. 'Catholic church in Bali closes for Nyepi' (undated), Bali Blog website http://www.baliblog.com/travel-tips/bali-travel/catholic-church-in-bali-closes-for-nyepi.html – Accessed 17 February 2009.

30. McGuire, D. 2003, 'Trouble In Bali Paradise', Hinduism Today website, July/August/September