Question
Could you please provide a relatively brief up to date overview on the treatment of underground Christians (not Catholics) in Hunan province (in Zhuzhou city, if possible)?

RESPONSE
Could you please provide a relatively brief up to date overview on the treatment of underground Christians (not Catholics) in Hunan province (in Zhuzhou city, if possible).

This response has three sections:

Registered and Unregistered Protestants in China
Protestants in Hunan province
Reports of incidents involving Christians in Hunan

Registered and Unregistered Protestants in China
In China, Protestantism is one of the five approved religions (which are Buddhism, Islam, Taoism, Catholicism, and Protestantism) and there many millions of practising Protestants in
China (estimates vary between 16 and 100 million\(^1\)). Protestants are expected to register their places of worship with the Three-Self Patriotic Movement (TSPM – the state-approved Protestant religious organisation). “Underground Protestants” are those who refuse to register with the TSPM, which is seen by some as a tool of Communism. Most sources estimate that the number of unregistered Protestants is greater than the number registered with the TSPM\(^1\) (US Department of State 2006, *International Religious Freedom Report 2006 -China*, 15 September – Attachment 1).

The government attitude towards unregistered Protestants varies depending on the attitude of the local authorities – in some places local officials tolerate unregistered Christian groups, in other places unregistered Christian groups are harassed to force them to register and even sometimes suppressed. Government action also varies over time, with campaigns of repression alternating with periods of toleration. The US Department of State *International Religious Freedom Report 2006 – China* states:

> During the period covered by this report, the Government’s respect for freedom of religion and freedom of conscience remained poor, especially for religious groups and spiritual movements that are not registered with the Government. Unregistered religious groups continued to experience varying degrees of official interference and harassment. Members of some unregistered religious groups were subjected to restrictions, including intimidation, harassment, and detention. Unregistered religious groups were pressured to register with government organs and government-sanctioned “patriotic” religious associations linked to the five main religions—Buddhism, Islam, Taoism, Catholicism, and Protestantism.

Religious practice and worship in officially sanctioned and unregistered places of worship continued to grow throughout the country, as did the number of religious believers. The extent of religious freedom varied widely within the country. … In most areas of the country, religious believers could worship without difficulty in officially approved venues. The Government in some locations built new places of worship to accommodate increasing numbers of religious believers.

Repression of unregistered Protestant church networks and “house” churches continued to be widely reported. Central Government officials stated that friends and family holding prayer meetings at home need not register with the Government, but China’s regulations on religious affairs (RRA) state that formal worship should take place only in government-approved venues. Sources in many locations continued to report that police and officials of local Religious Affairs Bureaus (RABs) interfered with house church meetings, often accusing the house church of disturbing neighbors or disrupting social order. House church leaders asserted that police routinely used noise complaints as a pretext for raiding their meetings. When police disrupted meetings, they sometimes detained worshippers attending such services for hours or days and prevented further house worship in the venues. Leaders

---

\(^1\) “The Government maintained that the country had more than 16 million Protestants, more than 55,000 registered churches and other places of worship, and 18 theological schools. Officials from the Three-Self Patriotic Movement (the state-approved Protestant religious organization) had estimated that at least 20 million Chinese worship in official churches. One local academic put the number of Protestants between 50 and 60 million, including both officially approved and unregistered churches. Foreign sources estimated that there were between 80-100 million Protestants worshipping in unregistered churches. A 2004 nongovernmental survey in Beijing tallied over 100,000 unregistered Protestants, far more than the 30,000 registered with authorities. Domestic and foreign experts agreed that the number of Protestants was growing rapidly. According to state-run media reports in August 2004, the number of Protestants was increasing by up to 600,000 annually. While it is difficult to arrive at an exact estimate, Christian groups outside China believe that the number of Chinese attending unregistered churches is expanding at a much faster rate.” (US Department of State 2006, *International Religious Freedom Report 2006 -China*, 15 September – Attachment 1).
sometimes faced harsher treatment, including detention, formal arrest and sentencing to reeducation or imprisonment. Again, treatment of unregistered groups varied regionally. For example, some local officials in Henan Province often mistreated unregistered Protestants, and some local officials in Hebei Province tightly controlled Roman Catholics loyal to the Vatican. In many localities, however, officials worked closely with registered religious groups to accomplish religious and social goals.

For more information on Protestants in China, see the following attachments:


- DIMIA Country Information Service 2006, *Country Information Report No.06/42 – China: Failed asylum seeker return decision*, (sourced from DFAT advice of 7 August 2006), 25 August. (Attachment 4) This is DFAT’s most recent advice on Christian groups which states “Underground church groups are by and large tolerated by the authorities.”


**Protestants in Hunan province (and Zhuzhou city)**

Hunan province is an inland province of 66 million in southern China. Hunan is divided into fourteen prefecture-level divisions, one of which is Zhuzhou City. Zhuzhou City, in eastern Hunan, has jurisdiction over 5 (rural) counties (Yanling, Chaling, Youxian, Liling and

Reports indicate that vigorous Christian communities exist throughout Hunan, although in smaller numbers than many eastern and northern provinces. Few reports were found of Protestants in Hunan and no reports were found of Protestants in Zhuzhou. It appears that some indigenous churches, such as the True Jesus Church, are strong in the province, as well as some Christian sects which have been suppressed as cults by the government.


By 2000, according to TPSM sources, Hunan had 300,000 Protestant Christians. They meet in some 800 registered churches and meeting points. There are also many house churches. In 1996, local house-church people estimated the total number of Protestants in Hunan as about 500,000, when the TPSM were giving a figure of 200,000. This would mean a rather larger proportion of house-church Christians to registered believers in the province. The indigenous True Jesus Church is strong in parts of the province. Apart from orthodox evangelical house churches, the “Shouters” and other sects are active. There were only about seventy registered pastors and seminary graduates in 1998 – far too few to cope, although they were aided by about 1,000 voluntary church workers. … There is a thriving house church movement in Hunan. (pp.253-4)

Lambert briefly notes that Christianity is growing in a number of cities close to Zhuzhou in northern Hunan, but does not mention Zhuzhou.

A profile given in Operation World, an evangelical profile of Christians in the world, estimates that 2.4% of Hunan’s population are Christian, with 1.8% belonging to Protestant house churches and the remainder to TPSM or Catholic churches (Johnstone, Patrick et al 2001, Operation World: 21st Century Edition, WEC International, p.173 – Attachment 36). This equates to 1.5 million Christians and 1.2 million house church members.


² Users should be aware that Wikipedia is a Web-based free-content encyclopaedia which is written collaboratively by volunteers. Research Services recommends that users of Wikipedia familiarise themselves with the regulatory practices which Wikipedia employs as a preventative measure against vandalism, bias and inaccuracy. For more information, see the recommended background reading available in the Wikipedia Topical Information Package.
Lu (Frank) Siqing (Director, Information Centre for Human Rights and Democratic Movements, Hong Kong) made the following claim about another Hunan group which was labelled a cult in 2000:

In the past, the Chinese Communist Party can only use the illegal assembly as a ground for detaining people. Now with this law passed, even without the assembly, if you are part of the cult, you can be arrested. Now, the two sectors called the China Evangelistic Fellowship and the China Fountain Group in Hunan has over one million followers. And they are a very mild group, and their teachings are very similar to the overseas or abroad Christian faith. However, they were also labeled as, quote, a cult last year. Six leaders were sent to the forced labor camps. It is estimated that over thousands of the religious leaders were arrested since last October. A small town that has only 5,000 inhabitants in Ueda, 75 persons were arrested. Two weeks ago, there are 16 China Evangelistic Fellowship followers were arrested in Hunan.


Leslie Hook from the Far Eastern Economic Review recently visited Hunan while writing about Christianity in China (Hook, Leslie 2006, ‘Religion: Christianity Comes to China’s Cities’, Far Eastern Economic Review, 1 December – Attachment 10). He gives a description of the church environment in the towns of Jishou in western Hunan and Xinqiao in northern Hunan and then notes:

Hunan is not particularly known as a hotbed of Christianity -- that honor goes to provinces like Henan, Zhejiang, Hubei and Anhui -- but Ms. Tan says all the churches in the area are growing. “Christianity has developed very quickly in Xinqiao,” she says, counting four official churches and two house churches in the township, and estimating around 1,000 Christians out of a population of 90,000. Most of the Christians here are women, a trend that holds true across China but particularly in the countryside.

In the nearby town of Zhangjiajie, the gender divide is stark. The town’s church -- a stately pink-and-cream stone building built in 1905 by a Finnish missionary -- holds around 600 people. But even though the pews are overflowing on Sunday morning, only a handful of men are visible, and the average age of the congregation is pushing 70. This demographic profile is not uncommon in rural areas, where Christianity has thrived since before the Communist Party came to power, but it is in sharp contrast with urban churches where men and women, old and young, seem to be in equal proportion. This demographic divide is one reason for the deep ideological divide between China’s rural and urban churches.

Reports of incidents involving Christians in Hunan

A number of reports were found of house-church leaders and members being arrested or mistreated in Hunan. Although the numbers reported to arrested are small in relation to the estimated number of Christians in the Hunan (see Lambert above), it is not possible to estimate how many unreported incidents occurred. The sources for most reports are foreign Christian activists or human rights groups (in particular the Hong Kong-based Information Center for Human Rights and Democracy whose leader’s assessments are at Attachment 16 and Attachment 29), except for the reports of the suppression of Christian groups labelled as
‘cults’ by the government, where government-controlled sources were used. The reports that follow are in reverse chronological order:

2005 November – The Texas-based China Aid Association reported that “a dozen members and leaders from house churches have been arrested in five cities in the central province of Hunan since July, the group said. Some of them, who belong to a well-known group called China Gospel Fellowship, were tortured and drugged by the State Security agents in order to extract information out of them, it said. Some were forced to spy on the church and were told that family members would be killed if they did not cooperate, it alleged. Hunan Province State Security refused to comment Tuesday and the report could not be independently confirmed.”  
(‘China arrests six underground Christian leaders’ 2005, Agence France Presse, 8 November – Attachment 17)

2003 December – Authorities in Hunan warned all institutes of higher learning to be on the alert against “illegal religious activities” during the Christmas holiday. “In a notice to the schools, the Hunan police department said that instances of “illegal religious activities” were on the rise among university students in the province.”  

2003 October – “Two underground Church leaders from central China’s Hunan province were detained on charges of “overthrowing the state power”, a human rights group reported Thursday. The police gave no reason for the arrest of the two men, Zhang Yinan and Xiao Biguang, but their detention was thought to be related to the drafting of a set of regulations aimed at coordinating underground churches in China, the Hong Kong-based Information Center for Human Rights and Democracy said. Zhang, 48, and 44-year-old Xiao were stopped on September 26 by the police force of the district of Lushan, in Henan. On October 21, Xiao’s wife Gou Qinghui, was informed that her husband had been placed in criminal detention for “overthrowing the state power”, a charge that could place him in jail for 10 years or more. Zhang’s family was informed 10 days earlier that the same charge had been brought against him.”  
(‘Two underground church leaders detained for “overthrowing state power’’ 2003, Agence France Presse, 23 October – Attachment 19)

2003 June – “In June 2003, five Christians of “The Ordained” house church were arrested in Liuyang County, Hunan Province. Two of them were released after one week detention, and the other three disappeared.  
In the early morning on June 5th, three policemen led by the town police station chief Li broke into Wengu Chen’s home in Shaxi Village, Wenjiashi Town. Chief Li shouted at Chen, “You were reported believing in cult. Want to against the Communist Party? You will face the consequence. Take him!” The police pushed him into the car. Then they went to Xiaosan Wang’s home in Louqian Village. With the same charge, the police also arrested Wang. At the night, the two Christians were transferred to the county Baiyikeng Detention Center. No information was available since then.  
About 7:00 in the morning on June 17th, Wenjiashi Town Police Station Party Director Yingjun Li led several policemen arrested Christians Xiuzhen Chen, Daxi Lin and Dalian Lin from their homes with the charge of “believing in cult”. At the night, they were sent to the county Baxianqiao Detention Center. A week later, Lin’s brothers were released. Xiuzhen Chen was transferred to Baiyikeng Detention Center. And no information was available since then.”  
2003 March “Yuezhen Chen, residing in Tian Village, Wenjia City, Hunan Province, and Guixiang Chen, residing in Wenshi Village, were two evangelists. In the morning on March 8th, 2003, they were preaching in Maotian Village, Shangli County, Jiangxi Province. The county police came and arrested them. The police took away 1500RMB (~$200) from them and escorted them to Shangli Town Police Station. The two preachers were interrogated for five hours and then released.”


2003 February – “At the night on February 10th, 2003, a group of police from Zhaoshi Town Precinct, Longshan County, Hunan Province, raided Christian Shaogui Yao’s home in Wafang Town, and arrested Shaofu Yao, Shiping Xiang, and Shaogui Yao who were meeting there. Then the police arrested two other village residents Shaokuan Yao and Shaoshen Yao from their homes. The five Christians were taken to the precinct. On the way, Policeman Xuefeng Wu used a flashlight to struck Shaogui Yao’s head and kicked him several kicks. The last kick hit his lower belly and made him almost fainted out. Once arriving at the precinct, the Christians were interrogated. Shiping Xiang was beaten up by Policeman Wenli Liu. He was also cuffed around a tree for more than an hour. The interrogation lasted till the 12th. But no results. Then the police extorted 200 RMB from Shaogui Yao and released them after ordering them not to leave the village within half a year and must to report to the police whenever required.”


2002 November – “HE Gaozong, aged 51 and LONG Tiesheng, aged 63, two preachers belonged to the “Ji-San-Bao” house church, were arrested by police while preaching in downtown of Hengdong County, Hunan Province. In the morning of November 23, 2002, HE and LONG stepped on a bus on a preaching trip. All in a sudden, three police led by chief KANG Xiangtao stormed the bus and detained the two preachers. Inside the police station, police confiscated their Christian books and 230 yuans cash they had. Later in the afternoon, police transferred both of them to the county police bureau. Associate Chief LUO Hongbin and security chief YANG Hongzhong interrogated them, and forced them to confess what they preached. Failed to find any evidence or proof, police put them into the county detention center overnight for the crime of “Obstruction of justice by organizing a cult”. The two preachers were later sent back to a detention center in Zhuzhou County, their hometown. During the ordeal, LONG was repeatedly beaten to bleeding by other prisoners. Prison guards also took away 80 yuans cash that was given to LONG by his family. Both men were released on December 19 and 21 after each paid 300 yuans in fine (no receipt).”


2002 October “At the night of October 31st, 2002, there were five preachers discussing the outreaching ministry in a private house in Baishui Town, Yongzhou City, Hunan Province. Suddenly, several local police broke into the house and detained the five preachers. At the local police station, the five preachers were body-searched, beaten and interrogated. Then the police escort them back to the house where they resided. The police searched the house and confiscated all spiritual materials and cash. Upon leaving, the police ordered, “Report to the police station at 8:00 tomorrow morning!” The next morning, they preachers
went to the police station as being ordered. The police tried to detain Leader Shuixiang Zhou, saying they wanted to put him to the jail. After the rest four appealed for mercy and gave 150 yuan, the police let them go. The five preachers were: Shuixiang Zhou, Yonghe Town, Hengyang City; Yunsheng Fen, Huangnitang Town, Yongzhou City; Xiaoxing Lei, Pengtang Town, Hengyang City; De’an Peng, Pengtang Town, Hengyang City; Zhongfu Tang, Yintian Town, Hengyang City."


2002 June – “At 3:00pm of June 18th, 2002, led by Fuying Wang, the village security officer, Guoqin Wu (male, 36-year-old), the team leader of Internal Security Protection Team of Longshan County, Hunan Province, together with some police from the suburban police station of the county capital, broke into the house of Shaoqun Zhang (female, 32-year-old). Without showing any legal documents, they ransacked the house. Having found nothing, they took Shaoqun Zhang to the Public Security Department of Longshan County for interrogation about her religion faith.

On June 19th, some police went to Shaoqun Zhang’s mother’s house, searching for evidence of her religious activities. But, still nothing was found.

On June 20th, the Public Security Department of Longshan County announced the conviction about Shaoqun Zhang: “illegal believing in God”. Then she was taken to the suburban police station of the county capital for 15-day detention. Sister Zhang was released on July 5th after paying a fine of 300 RMB (about $37).”


2001 September – “According to the fifth edition of the underground house church magazine, The Way, five rural Christians were arrested in September 2001 in Xintian county near Yongzhou City in Hunan province. One Christian was tortured into confessing that his house church was a cult and later sentenced to 18 months “re-education through labor.” According to the same magazine, on December 21, 2001, twenty-eight young Christian workers from the provinces of Hunan, Jiangxi and Henan were arrested while conducting Bible training classes in Jiahe City, Hunan. The police demanded 2,000 RMB ($240) from each person. About 10 of the believers were kept in prison.”


2001 July – “A municipal Religious and Nationality Affairs Commission official said there were more than 100,000 Protestant believers in the Yiyang region [in north Hunan province], which includes Yuanjiang and several other towns, out of a population of more than four million.”

(‘Chinese church collapse injures 38, officials say’ 2001, Reuters, 16 July – Attachment 27)

2000 March – “two sectors called the China Evangelistic Fellowship and the China Fountain Group in Hunan has over one million followers. And they are a very mild group, and their teachings are very similar to the overseas or abroad Christian faith. However, they were also labeled as, quote, a cult last year. Six leaders were sent to the forced labor camps. It is estimated that over thousands of the religious leaders were arrested since last October. A small town that has only 5,000 inhabitants in Ueda, 75 persons were arrested. Two weeks ago, there are 16 China Evangelistic Fellowship followers were arrested in Hunan.”

1999 November – Chinese authorities detained at least 103 members of Christian sects in the last three weeks. The total included 75 members of the All Scope Sect detained in Xiangtan city in the central province of Hunan on November 11 according to the Information Centre of Human Rights & Democratic Movement in China (‘China detains 103 members of Christian groups’ 1999, Reuters, 9 December – Attachment 28)

“The nationwide crackdown has been going on for four months. Because the government does not allow the state-run news agencies to report on the crackdown, it is very difficult to obtain the concrete number of the members who have been rounded up. However, on November 19 of 1999, in one 5000 people small Town of Hunan province alone, 75 people of “Total Scope Church” including Liu Gui-hua got arrested during their gathering. Therefore, we have every reason to believe that several thousand people have been arrested all over the country. The “Total Scope Church” is a typical group that refuses to cooperate with the Communist Party and thus was labeled as a cult. The only reason that it was declared as a cult is that the Chinese authorities thought that it was against the Chinese Communist Party.”


1999 June – Liu Jia-guo, leader of the Jusen (also Zhushen/ Zhushengjiao or Supreme Spirit) Christian sect in Hunan province, was sentenced to death for swindling fellow sect members (‘Condemned founder of Zhushen sect interviewed’ 1999, BBC Monitoring Service, (Source: Guangming Ribao, Beijing), 31 July – Attachment 30; ‘China sentences sect leader to death – rights group’ 1999, Reuters, 14 July – Attachment 31)

1999 May – “In recent years, aimed at the revival of perverse religious sects or heretical religious cults in certain regions, Hunan public security or police agencies have organized special forces, launching five mammoth province-wide campaigns against such cults. They have destroyed nearly 10,000 cults, cracking down by law on up to 10,000 key cult leaders, confiscating over 300,000 yuan in operating fees and more than 200,000 pieces of propaganda material, and holding nearly 1,000 legal indoctrination and study classes, for tens of thousands people. The most spectacular of these was the crackdown by Hunan of the “Zhushen Jiao” [Lord God Cult], which the Public Security Ministry has listed as the worst of the five major cults in China.”


1998 February – On 24th February, 1998, six Christians were arrested in Changsha, Hunan. Two of them were Christians from Jiangxi. All they wanted to do was to stop by in Changsha to visit fellow Christians there. (‘Mainland Christian preacher tells Hong Kong journal of persecution’ 1998, BBC Monitoring Service, (Source: Kai Fang, Hong Kong), 17 December – Attachment 33)

1994 March – Zheng Musheng, a farmer and house-church Christian from Dongkou county in Hunan province, died in detention in January 1994, within 24 hours of being taken into police custody. One report claims “According to NNI [United States-based News Network International], persecution of Christians in Hunan has been rampant and police have often arrested underground Christians for “disturbing public order”.”
List of Sources Consulted

Internet Sources:

Government Information & Reports
Immigration & Refugee Board of Canada http://www.irb.gc.ca/
UK Home Office http://www.homeoffice.gov.uk
US Department of State http://www.state.gov/
US Department of State website http://www.state.gov

United Nations (UN)
UNHCR http://www.unhchr.ch/

Non-Government Organisations
Amnesty International website http://www.amnesty.org/
Freedom House http://www.freedomhouse.org/template.cfm?page=1
Human Rights Watch http://www.hrw.org/
International Helsinki Federation for Human Rights http://www.ihf-hr.org/welcome.php
Human Rights Internet (HRI) website http://www.hri.ca

International News & Politics
BBC News website http://news.bbc.co.uk/

Region Specific Links
http://www.aidtochurch.org/ Aid to the Church in Need (ACN)
http://www.chinaaid.org/english_site/index.php China Aid Association
http://www.hsstudyc.org.hk/ Holy Spirit Study Centre, Hong Kong
http://www.monitorchina.org/chinese_site/index.php
http://www.china21.org/English/index.htm The Committee for the Investigation on Persecution of Religion in China
http://www.equip.org/ Christian Research Institute
http://www.freechurchforchina.org/ – Freechurchforchina.org

Search Engines

Databases:


17. ‘China arrests six underground Christian leaders’ 2005, *Agence France Presse*, 8 November (Factiva)


19. ‘Two underground church leaders detained for “overthrowing state power”’ 2003, *Agence France Presse*, 23 October (Factiva)


27. ‘Chinese church collapse injures 38, officials say’ 2001, Reuters, 16 July (Factiva)
28. ‘China detains 103 members of Christian groups’ 1999, Reuters, 9 December (Factiva)


30. ‘Condemned founder of Zhushen sect interviewed’ 1999, BBC Monitoring Service, Source: Guangming Ribao (Beijing), 31 July (Factiva)

31. ‘China sentences sect leader to death – rights group’ 1999, Reuters, 14 July (Factiva)

32. ‘Perverse religious sect’ wiped out’ 1999, BBC Monitoring Service, Source: Chinese journal Liaowang, 18 May (Factiva)

33. ‘Mainland Christian preacher tells Hong Kong journal of persecution’ 1998, BBC Monitoring Service, Source: Kai Fang (Hong Kong), 17 December (Factiva)

34. ‘Prison Staff Reinforced After Inmates Beat To Death “New Christian Follower”’ 1994, BBC Monitoring Service, Source: Ta Kung Pao (Hong Kong), 1 April (Factiva)

35. ‘Police Kill Christian’ 1994, South China Morning Post, 10 March (Factiva)